



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 23, 2011

Mr. Jeffrey L. Moore
Brown & Hofmeister, LLP
740 East Campbell Road, Suite 800
Richardson, Texas 75081

OR2011-03957

Dear Mr. Moore:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 411938.

The City of Italy (the "city"), which you represent, received two requests from the same requestor for payroll records and call logs for a specified time period, employment applications and background checks pertaining to several named officers, and the requestor's personnel file. You state the city will release some of the requested information. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.117, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which governs the release of reports or statements submitted to the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officer Standards and Education ("TCLEOSE"). Section 1701.454 provides as follows:

- (a) A report or statement submitted to the [TCLEOSE] under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, unless the person resigned or was terminated due to

substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

Occ. Code § 1701.454. The submitted information includes a F-5 Report of Separation of License Holder form. In this instance, the named officer did not resign due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses. Therefore, the city must withhold the submitted F-5 form, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one's current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (term CHRI does not include driving record information). Upon review, we find a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, the city must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.¹ However, we find you have not demonstrated the remaining information you have marked constitutes CHRI for purposes of chapter 411 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the remaining information you have marked may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

¹As our ruling is dispositive with respect to the information at issue, we need not address your remaining argument against its disclosure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy. For information to be protected from public disclosure by the common-law right of privacy, the information must meet the criteria set out by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation v. Texas Industrial Accident Board*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). In *Industrial Foundation*, the Texas Supreme Court stated information is excepted from disclosure if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the release of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. 540 S.W.2d at 685. To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. The doctrine of common-law privacy protects a compilation of an individual's criminal history, which is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, active warrant information or other information relating to an individual's current involvement in the criminal justice system does not constitute criminal history information for the purposes of section 552.101. *See Gov't Code* § 411.081(b). This office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 343 (1982) (references in emergency medical records to drug overdoses, acute alcohol intoxication, obstetrical or gynecological illnesses, convulsions or seizures, and emotional or mental distress), 455 (1987) (information pertaining to prescription drugs, specific illnesses, operations and procedures, and physical disabilities protected from disclosure).* This office has also found personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history).* We further note the scope of a public employee's privacy is narrow. *See Open Records Decision No. 423 at 2 (1984).* Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the city must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.² However, we find you have not demonstrated how the remaining information you have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing or the information is of legitimate public concern. Thus, the remaining information you have marked may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

²As our ruling is dispositive with respect to portions of the information at issue, we need not address your remaining argument under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court recently held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, No. 08-0172, 2010 WL 4910163 (Tex. Dec. 3, 2010). Having carefully reviewed the information at issue, we have marked information that must be withheld under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with sections 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code. Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. We note section 552.117(a)(2) is not applicable to a former spouse. We also note a post office box number is not a "home address" for purposes of section 552.117(a). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 at 4 (1994) (legislative history makes clear that purpose of Gov't Code § 552.117 is to protect public employees from being harassed at home). Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code.³ However, the remaining information you have marked pertains to the former spouse of the officer at issue or consists of a post office box number. Accordingly, section 552.117(a)(2) is not applicable to the remaining information you have marked, and the city may not withhold any of the remaining information on this basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Accordingly, the city must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.⁴

In summary, the city must withhold (1) the F-5 form we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, (2) the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction

³We note a governmental body may withhold a peace officer's home address and telephone number, personal cellular telephone and pager numbers, social security number, and family member information under section 552.117(a)(2) without requesting a decision from this office. *See* Open Records Decision No. 670 (2001); Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

⁴We note Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including a copy of a Texas driver's license under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

with section 411.083 of the Government Code, (3) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, (4) the information we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code, (5) the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code, and (6) the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/tf

Ref: ID# 411938

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)